

ISSN 2311-6986 (Online)

ISSN 2226-5260 (Print)

САХКТ- ЕТЕР YПСК ОCY АРСТБЕНН Н БЕРС ТЕТ

ST PETERSBURG STATE UNIVERSITY

HORIZON

СС Е ОВАН

STUDIES IN PHENOMENOLOGY
STUDIEN ZUR PHÄNOMENOLOGIE
ÉTUDES PHÉNOMÉNOLOGIQUES



10 (1) 2021

SPECIAL ISSUE

Y YT BE !ME C HAPHA :
K HHOBA OHHЫM CC E OBAH M

TO LET THINGS BE! INTERDISCIPLINARY PHENOMENOLOGY —
CHALLENGES FOR INNOVATIVE RESEARCH

HORIZON
STUDIES IN PHENOMENOLOGY
Volume 10, Number 1 2021

SPECIAL ISSUE
TO LET THINGS BE! INTERDISCIPLINARY PHENOMENOLOGY —
CHALLENGES FOR INNOVATIVE RESEARCH

The journal is indexed in: Scopus | Emerging Sources Citation Index (Web of Science Core Collection) | DOAJ | CrossRef | ProQuest | CEEOL | J-Gate | The Philosopher's Index | Ulrich | WorldCat | Google Scholar | CyberLeninka | RISC | OAJI | COPE | ICI | MLA International Bibliography | Open AIR | IBZ Online | IBR Online | De Gruyter | CEJSH | ResearchBib |

Mass media registration certificate C 77-75574 issued on May 8, 2019

The founders of the journal:
St Petersburg State University and Artemenko Natalia

ALL THE SUBMITTED ARTICLES ARE SUBJECT TO PEER-REVIEW AND SELECTION BY EXPERTS

Editor-in-chief

Natalia Artemenko (*Russia*) St Petersburg State University

Guest Editors

Ineta Kivle (*University of Latvia, Riga*)

Raivis Bičevskis (*University of Latvia, Riga*)

Executive Secretary

Aleksandra Pozdeeva (*Russia*) St Petersburg State University

Editorial Board

Hans Rainer Sepp (*Czech Republic*) Charles University in Prague; Karel Novotný (*Czech Republic*) Charles University in Prague; Alexander Schnell (*Germany*) University of Wuppertal; Andrei Patkul (*Russia*) St Petersburg State University; Georgy Chernavin (*Russia*) National Research University "Higher School of Economics", Moscow; Andrei Lavruchin (*Russia*) National Research University "Higher School of Economics", St Petersburg; Fedor Stanzhevskiy (*Russia*) St Petersburg Technical University (Technological Institute); Mikhail Belousov (*Russia*) Russian Academy of National Economy and Public Administration, Moscow; Oleg Mukhutdinov (*Russia*) Ural Federal University, Ekaterinburg; Nicolás Garrera-Tolbert (*USA*) St Francis College, New York; Masumi Nagasaka (*Japan*) Waseda University, Tokyo; Svetlana Nikonova (*Russia*) St Petersburg University of the Humanities and Social Sciences

Advisory Board

Dan Zahavi (*Denmark*) University of Copenhagen; Nicolas Fernando de Warren (*Belgium*) KU Leuven; Hans Helmuth Gander (*Germany*) Albert Ludwig University of Freiburg; Michael Gabel (*Germany*) University of Erfurt; Jean Grondin (*Canada*) University of Montreal; Sebastian Luft (*USA*) Marquette University; Dieter Lohmar (*Germany*) University of Köln, Director of Husserl-Archive; Victor Molchanov (*Russia*) Russian State University for the Humanities; Nelly Motroshilova (*Russia*) Institute of Philosophy, Russian Academy of Sciences; Alexei Savin (*Russia*) Russian Academy of National Economy and Public Administration; Jaroslav Slinin (*Russia*) St Petersburg State University; Alexander Haardt (*Germany*) Ruhr University of Bochum; Peter Trawny (*Germany*) University of Wuppertal; Andrew Haas (*Russia*) National Research University "Higher School of Economics", Moscow; Mikhail Khorkov (*Germany, Russia*) University of Erfurt, Institute of Philosophy, Russian Academy of Sciences; Natalia Brosova (*Russia*) Belgorod National Research University; Danil Razeev (*Russia*) St Petersburg State University; Annabelle Dufourcq (*Netherlands*) Radboud University Nijmegen; Julia Orlova t (*Russia*) St Petersburg State University; Roman Gromov t (*Russia*) Southern Federal University; László Tengelyi t (*Germany*) University of Wuppertal

HORIZON
STUDIES IN PHENOMENOLOGY
Volume 10, Number 1 2021

SPECIAL ISSUE

T LET THINGS BE! INTERDISCIPLINARY PHENOMENOLOGY —
CHALLENGES FOR INNOVATIVE RESEARCH

Guest Editors:

Ineta Kivle (University of Latvia, Riga)
Raivis Bīceviskis (University of Latvia, Riga)

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION..... 11

I. RESEARCH

PHENOMENOLOGY IN LATVIA

MAIJA KŪLE
ONE HUNDRED YEARS OF PHENOMENOLOGY IN LATVIA: 1920-2020..... 15

BEING. EXISTENCE. MAN

ANNA MALECKA, PIOTR MRÓZ
THE HEIDEGGERIAN CONCEPT OF DASEIN AND ITS ONTOLOGICAL MODALITY:
DAS MAN..... 45

KIMIYO MURATA-SORACI
SICHÜBERLIEFERUNG: RE-MOVING THE HISTORY OF BEING AS PRESENCE..... 61

SOCIAL INTERACTION

ANNA KHAKHALOVA
BODILY-AFFECTIVE ATTUNEMENT IN SOCIAL INTERACTION..... 77

ÇIRTS JANKOVSKIS NORMS AS A MEDIUM: PHENOMENOLOGICAL APPROACH IN ANALYSING THE PERCEPTION OF SOCIAL MEDIA.....	96
----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----

PHENOMENOLOGY AND RELIGION

RIHARDS KŪLIS HEIDEGGER'S BEING, RAHNER'S GOD: IS THE QUESTION STILL RELEVANT OR ALREADY ANSWERED?.....	108
VELGA VĒVERE RADICAL DEMAND AND SPONTANEITY IN K. E. LOGSTRUP'S PHENOMENOLOGICAL ETHICS WITH CONTINUOUS REFERENCE TO S. KIERKEGAARD.....	123
MĀRA KIOPE PHENOMENOLOGY OF COGNITION IN THE CONTEXT OF MANY-SIDED HUMANISM OF STANISLAVS LADUSĀNS.....	140

TEMPORALITY

JAMES MENSCH TEMPORALITY AS A SPATIAL FIELD OF PRESENCE.....	163
ULDIS VĒGNERS HUSSLER AND DIMENSIONS OF TEMPORALITY: A FRAMEWORK FOR THE ANALYSIS OF TEMPORAL EXPERIENCE.....	186

LISTENING, LANGUAGE, SILENCE

MAJA BJELICA LISTENING: AN INTERDISCIPLINARY PATH TOWARDS LETTING THINGS BE.....	212
VIRGIL W. BROWER TECHNO-TELEPATHY & SILENT SUBVOCAL SPEECH-RECOGNITION ROBOTICS: DO ANDROIDS READ OF ELECTRIC THOUGHTS?.....	232
GEORGY CHERNAVIN ON THE IMPOSSIBILITY OF THE PHENOMENOLOGICAL LANGUAGE IN THE CONTEXT OF WITTGENSTEIN'S MANUSCRIPTS FROM 1929-1933.....	258

ARTWORK AND PHENOMENOLOGICAL HERMENEUTICS

ONUR KARAMERCAN HEIDEGGER'S WAY TO POETIC DWELLING VIA BEING AND TIME.....	268
-------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

PATRICK MARTIN BEING STRUCK: GADAMER ON THE CONTEMPORANEITY OF ART.....	286
----------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

IL BOOK REVIEWS

FREEDOM AS THE MAIN PROBLEM OF PHILOSOPHY GÜNTHER NEUMANN DER FREIHEITSBEGRIFF BEI GOTTFRIED WILHELM LEIBNIZ UND MARTIN HEIDEGGER Philosophische Schriften, Band 97. Berlin: Duncker & Humblot, Berlin, 2019. ISBN: 978-3-428-15537-8	
GÜNTHER NEUMANN HEIDEGGER UND LEIBNIZ. MIT EINEM GELEITWORT VON FRIEDRICH-WILHELM VON HERRMANN (DAS DENKEN MARTIN HEIDEGGERS II 2. HRSG. VON HANS-CHRISTIAN GÜNTHER) Nordhausen: Verlag Traugott Bautz GmbH, 2020. ISBN: 978-3-95948-493-0 (RAIVIS BICĒVSKIS, VALTERS ZARIĪS).....	305
P CHEYNE, A. HAMILTON, M. PADDISON (EDS.). PHILOSOPHY OF RHYTHM: AESTHETICS, MUSIC, POETICS New York: Oxford University Press, 2019. ISBN 978-0-19-934778-0 (INETA KIVLE).....	312
WITOLD PLOTKA, PATRICK ELDRIDGE (EDS.) EARLY PHENOMENOLOGY IN CENTRAL AND EASTERN EUROPE. MAIN FIGURES, IDEAS, AND PROBLEMS Contributions to Phenomenology, Vol. 113. Springer, 2020. ISBN 978-3-030-39622-0 (JAROSLAVA VYDROVĀ).....	320
DIALOGIC PHENOMENOLOGY OF PAIN EXPERIENCE SAULIUS GENIUSAS THE PHENOMENOLOGY OF PAIN Athens, Ohio: Ohio University Press, 2020. ISBN 978-0-8214-2403-2 (VITALIY LEKHTSIER).....	328

<https://doi.org/10.21638/2226-5260-2021-10-1-11-14>

INTRODUCTION

There are special times and places in the history of European philosophy—the “battlefields of philosophy” (Flasch, 2008)—where thought is articulated in such a way as to have a significant impact not only on a narrow circle of students but also to create a broad (and lasting) “footprint” of continuations and transformations, which also has an agonistic, debate-inducing character. One such place of articulation of thought and such time is also the phenomenological movement. The philosophical heritage of Edmund Husserl and Martin Heidegger influences not only the development of phenomenology and hermeneutics, the formation of the philosophy of existence, and even not only the development of continental philosophy in general, but also new approaches to research in a wide range of sciences and arts. Phenomenology today participates in the life sciences, interpretations of modern art, and the study of social processes to the same extent as it continues the internal conversation about its basic concepts. Although the influence of Husserl and Heidegger on the branches of science has developed over several decades, creating such interdisciplinary sub-genres as the phenomenology of music, body, religion, art, medicine, technology, etc., however, the new search for stability and self-sufficiency in today’s global and fragile society also invites phenomenology to embark on another philosophical adventure accompanied by highly interdisciplinary research.

Since Husserl’s Introduction to volume II of *Logical Investigations*, where he formulates the well-known principle of phenomenology, namely that “we want to return to the things themselves” (Husserl, 1984,10), the conversation and competition about what are the “things” to which to return has begun. This is especially reversed and exacerbated by the question in Heidegger’s text *My Way in Phenomenology*: “from where and how is it defined what should be experienced as a ‘thing itself’ according to the principle of phenomenology? Is it consciousness and its objectivity or the being of existence in its unconcealedness and concealedness?” (Heidegger, 1969, 87). This is just the beginning of a conversation about things; this conversation has continued

<https://doi.org/10.21638/2226-5260-2021-10-1-11-14>

INTRODUCTION

There are special times and places in the history of European philosophy—the “battlefields of philosophy” (Flasch, 2008)—where thought is articulated in such a way as to have a significant impact not only on a narrow circle of students but also to create a broad (and lasting) “footprint” of continuations and transformations, which also has an agonistic, debate-inducing character. One such place of articulation of thought and such time is also the phenomenological movement. The philosophical heritage of Edmund Husserl and Martin Heidegger influences not only the development of phenomenology and hermeneutics, the formation of the philosophy of existence, and even not only the development of continental philosophy in general, but also new approaches to research in a wide range of sciences and arts. Phenomenology today participates in the life sciences, interpretations of modern art, and the study of social processes to the same extent as it continues the internal conversation about its basic concepts. Although the influence of Husserl and Heidegger on the branches of science has developed over several decades, creating such interdisciplinary sub-genres as the phenomenology of music, body, religion, art, medicine, technology, etc., however, the new search for stability and self-sufficiency in today’s global and fragile society also invites phenomenology to embark on another philosophical adventure accompanied by highly interdisciplinary research.

Since Husserl’s Introduction to volume II of *Logical Investigations*, where he formulates the well-known principle of phenomenology, namely that “we want to return to the things themselves” (Husserl, 1984,10), the conversation and competition about what are the “things” to which to return has begun. This is especially reversed and exacerbated by the question in Heidegger’s text *My Way in Phenomenology*: “from where and how is it defined what should be experienced as a ‘thing itself’ according to the principle of phenomenology? Is it consciousness and its objectivity or the being of existence in its unconcealedness and concealedness?” (Heidegger, 1969, 87). This is just the beginning of a conversation about things; this conversation has continued

in discussions between the generation of Merleau-Ponty, Michel Henry, Marc Richir, Jean-Luc Marion, Bernhard Waldenfels and younger generations. The call to return to things and their being has contributed to the formation of knowledge given in immediate experience, thus being able to unlock the case under study in its changing concealed unconcealedness, while preserving its truth. However, the two dimensions outlined at the beginning of phenomenology—Husserl's quest for the perspectival uncovering of in-depth meaning-constitution processes and Heidegger's question of being—are different, but both show that the birth of new knowledge is the ability to observe, see and hear, think and understand, beginning from what "is" and how it "is." Phenomenology today is still on its way towards what "is."

The thematic coverage of this special issue was to some extent influenced by the international interdisciplinary conference "Let things be! Edmund Husserl 160, Martin Heidegger 130," which took place at the University of Latvia, Riga in December 2019, the proceedings of which can be read in the journal "Horizon. Studies in Phenomenology" (Kivle, Biļevskis & Lācis, 2020, 373-381). Any researcher of phenomenology and hermeneutics was invited to contribute to the content of this issue. As a result, the journal's topics cover issues of the history of phenomenology, the detailed application of the phenomenological method in the study of specific phenomena, Husserl's or Heidegger's concepts and the importance of phenomenology and hermeneutics in other fields of knowledge and art. The topics of the journal deviate from in-depth analysis of transcendental philosophy, fundamental ontology, and phenomenological methods, and draw attention to the understanding of certain concepts and their possible modification in specific situations and thematic areas, looking at the history of phenomenology in a regional context.

Phenomenology entered Latvia as soon as it was established. The article "One Hundred Years of Phenomenology in Latvia: 1920-2020" by Maija Kļe gives a comprehensive insight into phenomenology studies and research in Latvia. The article covers a hundred years, beginning with the contributions and critiques of Husserl's pupil Teodors Celms (1893-1989) to the development of phenomenology, following with the merits of Kurt Stavehagen (1884-1951), working at the Riga Herder Institute, Heidegger's visit to Riga in 1928 up to the latest research in recent decades.

Two articles are devoted to the understanding of being, existence and man. A. Malecka's and P. Mroz's article "The Heideggerian Concept of Dasein and Its Ontological Modality: Das Man," in which, using the basic concepts of Heidegger's existential period (before *Kehre*) magnum opus *Being and Time*, an original interpretation of Heidegger's such existentials as *das Man* and *Dasein* is offered, analyzing our being-in-the-world in two different ways: *Dasein's* existence in the world is based on

structure of possibilities, while *das Man* is dedicated to a concrete choice. Kimiyo Murata-Soraci views Heidegger's philosophy from middle-voice point of view. In accordance with it, the author analyses Heidegger's concept *Da-sein* and Derrida's concept *Animot* as the limit between the human and the animal in the realization of human ways to be in the world.

Social interactions and phenomenological problems of media are analysed in two articles. Anna Khakhalova's article "Bodily-Affective Attunement of Social Interaction" views the problem of body attunement between participants of a social interaction and shows how subjects permanently attune to each other on different levels in emotional affordances. Ćirts Jankovskis' paper "Norms as a Medium: Phenomenological Approach in Analysing the Perception of Social Media" analyses concept of norms as a certain mode of perception as well as an object of thoughts therefore the author shows how norms as a medium are understood in comparison to language.

Phenomenological approach to ethics, religion and God is concerned in three articles. Rihards Kūlis' paper "Heideggers Sein, Rahners Gott—noch immer aktuelle Frage oder fällig gewordene Antwort?" views fundamental questions about "unfinished project" of Western rationality exploring ultimate directions of "God" and "Being." Velga Vēvere' paper "Radical Demans and Spontaneity in K. E. Logstrup's Phenomenological Ethics with Continuous Reference to S. Kierkegaard" explores notions of Logstrup's ethics in confrontation with Kierkegaard's basic concepts. Māra Kiope's research "Phenomenology of Cognition in the Context of Many-Sided Humanism of Stanislavs Ladusāns" shows how Ladusāns places phenomenology of cognition or many-sided gnoseology at the corner-stone of his programme of cultural regeneration.

There are two articles dedicated to temporality: James Mensch' research on "Temporality as a Spatial Field of Presence" and Uldis Vēgners' paper "Husserl and Dimensions of Temporality: A Framework for Analyses of Temporal Experience." James Mensch shows how we experience time in the widest sense as a "field of presence" where spatial apprehension is also included. Uldis Vēgners analyses temporality as one of the key components of our experience and shows how experience of time is a fluid and complex phenomenon consisting of a multitude of dimensions.

Phenomenological approach to art, listening, silence and language are presented in articles written by Maja Bjelica, "Listening: An Interdisciplinary Path Towards Letting Things Be"; Virgil W. Brower, "Techno-Telepathy & Silent Subvocal Speech-Recognition Robotics: Do Androids Read of Electric Thoughts?"; Georgy Chernavin, "On the Impossibility of the Phenomenological Language in the Context of Wittgenstein's Manuscripts from 1929-1933"; Onur Karamercan, "Heidegger's Way

to Poetic Dwelling via Being and Time” and Patrick Martin, “Being Struck: Gadamer on the Contemporaneity of Art.” These studies are different by way of phenomenological and hermeneutical approach. Maja Bjelica views listening as a potential for revealing a deeper sense of being in the world and as a possible way towards inhabiting our life-world. Virgil W. Brower considers subvocal “speech” as a mode of saying and binds it with Husserl’s phenomenology of language and Heidegger’s warning against enframing language within calculative technics. Georgy Chernavin’s article opens up new possibilities for comparison between the Wittgensteinian project of the “primal language” and Husserlian, Heideggerian and Finkian projects of “phenomenological language.” Onur Karamercan touches upon “dwelling” as a concept that bridges different Heidegger’s works in during the period of Being and Time and latter philosophy. Patrick Martin’s central question concerns the relationship between art experience and experience of understanding in the context of Gadamer’s hermeneutics.

Published articles, both in terms of thematic diversity and different phenomenological approaches, form a multidimensional mosaic for the development of interdisciplinarity. However, they are yet another attempt for phenomenologically schooled thinking to get closer to things. These two directions of the articles are by no means contradictory, as long as the unity of intuition and methodological rigor already established at the beginning of phenomenology is maintained.

REFERENCES

- Flasch, K. (2008). *Kampfplätze der Philosophie*. Frankfurt am Main: Vittorio Klostermann.
- Kivle, I., Bičevskis, R., & Lācis, Kr. (2020). The Review of the International Interdisciplinary Conference “To let things be! Edmund Husserl 160, Martin Heidegger 130” (December 10-12, 2019, Riga, Latvia). *HORIZON. Studies in Phenomenology*, 9 (1), 373-381.
- Husserl, E. (1984). *Logische Untersuchungen*. Bd. 2 (Hua XIX-1). The Hague/Boston/Lancaster: Martinus Nijhoff.
- Heidegger, M. (1969). *Zur Sache des Denkens*. Tübingen: Max Niemeyer Verlag.

Ineta KIVLE, Raivis BIČEVSKIS

<https://doi.org/10.21638/2226-5260-2021-10-1-312-319>

P CHEYNE, A. HAMILTON, M. PADDISON (EDS.).

PHILOSOPHY OF RHYTHM: AESTHETICS, MUSIC, POETICS

New York: Oxford University Press, 2019. ISBN 978-0-19-934778-0

INETA KIVLE

Doctor in Philosophy, Leading Researcher.
Head of Interdisciplinary Research Centre,
Deputy Director of Academic Library of the University of Latvia.
LV-1235 Riga, Latvia.
E-mail: ineta.kivle@lu.lv; inetakivle21@gmail.com

The review provides an outline of the collective monograph *The Philosophy of Rhythm: Aesthetic Music, Poetics*, edited by Peter Cheyne, Andy Hamilton and Max Paddison, published by Oxford University Press, 2019. Concept of rhythm is analysed from different perspectives—philosophical, musical and psychological. It considers a multidisciplinary approach and also includes both analytic and continental philosophical traditions. Rhythm is viewed as a pulse that is going through various metric structures including particular pieces of music, paintings, examples of poetry and philosophy. Twenty eight authors from the entire world discuss rhythm and specify definitions of rhythm. They try to give answers on crucial questions uniting experienced rhythm in philosophy and arts, thus giving an important contribution to rhythm studies. The book is organised thematically and based on different aspects of rhythm manifestations. The main questions of the research are as follows: How is rhythm experienced? Does rhythm necessarily involve movement? Why rhythm is so deeply rooted in human life? How can static configurations be rhythmic? How does a rhythmic structure change from a stable pattern to a flexible texture? All these questions concern two interwoven issues common for the volume in general: immanence of rhythm to arts and human experience of it.

Keywords: rhythm, movement, time, space, art, philosophy, multidisciplinary, aesthetics, experience.

© INETA KIVLE, 2021

РЕЦЕНЗИЯ НА КНИГУ ПИТЕРА ЧЕЙНА, ЭНДИ ГАМИЛЬТОНА,
МАКСА ПАДДИСОНА (РЕД.)

PHILOSOPHY OF RHYTHM: AESTHETICS, MUSIC, POETICS

New York: Oxford University Press, 2019. ISBN 978-0-19-934778-0

LV-1235

E-mail: ineta.kivle@lu.lv; inetakivle21@gmail.com

Oxford University Press 2019

1. INTRODUCTION

The collective monograph *The Philosophy of Rhythm: Aesthetics, Music, Poetics* concerns different philosophical approaches and includes both continental and analytic traditions. The current review does not analyse all its chapters in detail but focuses more on the phenomenological point of view. The review is structured as follows: it gives a brief introduction on the concept of rhythm in philosophy; marks out the

contribution of the current volume; provides an outline on the content of its parts and concludes on the importance of research of rhythm in interdisciplinary philosophy.

Studies of rhythm relate to different spheres, but simultaneously they form a complex application of appropriate and encompassing philosophical technique. Theoretical approach to rhythm transforms and changes together with the conceptual ambitions; therefore, they broaden the scope of the concepts' definition in correspondence with the explored philosophical stances. Multidisciplinary approach deepens understanding of rhythm and shows the role of rhythm in the world around us, it gives new opportunities for philosophical reflections and makes human activities clearer. In general, rhythm donates to metre, sequence, repetition, order, measured time and space, thus showing quantitative assessments. Differently from mathematically measurable world philosophy views immanence of rhythm and opens the deepest levels of human constitution.

In the history of philosophy, the rhythm research is characterised by fluctuations, it intensifies periodically, but then subsides again¹. In recent decades rhythm research has been activated, and several volumes, dedicated to rhythmology, have been written. French philosopher Pascal Michon² has created an interdisciplinary research network: RHUTHMOS that could be considered as one of the most effective contributions to contemporary rhythm studies.

¹ The notion of rhythm is known from Ancient times. At the beginning, it was used as a technical term characterised by such sub-concepts as measure, number, periodicity. Ancient philosophers highlighted the main directions of philosophy of rhythm: the order of a sequence of time; temporary disposition of something flowing; a form that was itself changing during its manifestations; harmony and disharmony of internal and outer rhythms; rhythm of music and speech; rhythm of body and soul. In Ancient philosophy rhythm is mentioned as something flowing and changing (Heraclitus). Rhythm was viewed in relations with physical objects (Democritus) that gives impulse for philosophy of nature developed by Diderot and Goethe, later by Nietzsche, then Deleuze. Pythagoras and Platonic paradigm views rhythm in mathematical and universal aspect-rhythmic sequence of time-length is organised by number. Aristotle develops a poetic aspect of rhythm and gives impulse for rhythm analysis in mimetic structures (Kivle, 2020). From the middle of 18th century, the concept of rhythm embraces philosophy, theory, medicine, art, language, natural sciences, linking rhythm to mathematical and numerical relationships, comparing music with rhythm in nature. Rhythm was shown to be documentable, visually depictable, and employable in identifying and developing processes by creating technological tools that show rhythms of mind-body interactions. The several devices have been invented: Carl Ludwig's kymograph (1846), for measuring of variation of blood pressure; Édouard-Léon Scott de Martinville's phonograph (1857); Helmholtz' myograph (1850) for muscle twitches.

² Pascal Michon—PhD, works at Education Nationale in Paris. He does research in Cultural History, Ethics, Aesthetics and Metaphysics, Conceptual History of Rhythm.

Rhythm studies related to phenomenology have not yet been widely developed, except for some doctoral thesis on phenomenology of rhythm³ and some recent investigations in phenomenology of rhythm⁴. The reason of it may be in the fact that Husserl does not write about rhythm directly. However, phenomenology gives an impulse for various interpretations of rhythm: rhythms of intersubjective communication; flux of internal time, time-objects; rhythms of internal constitution of man and rhythms of surrounding worlds; bodily and sensory perception of rhythm, etc. Phenomenology of rhythm is based on direct experience therefore giving feasibility for analyses of how rhythm is given, how its meanings are constituted and how rhythm differs from other meaningful phenomena. The contribution of Anna Yampolskaja⁵ could be mentioned there. Analysing Henri Maldiney's⁶ views on aesthetical experience, she concerns the concept of rhythm and binds it with sensory perception that gives access to the world as a whole and also shows sensing as a holistic level of intersubjective communication.

2. OUTLINE OF CHAPTERS

The multidisciplinary research *Philosophy of Rhythm: Aesthetics, Music, Poetics* is dedicated to various kinds of arts and views them in perspective of rhythm concept binding it with such notions as experienced time, space, sensations and body. The volume editors: Peter Cheyne⁷, Andrey Hamilton⁸ and Max Paddison⁹ stimulate a multidisciplinary examination of particular manifestations of rhythm and focus on rhythm in its relationship between everyday embodied experience, on the one hand, and the specific experience of music, dance, and poetry, on the other hand. Therefore, the main direction of

³ Two dissertations are published in data base Proquest Dissertation Publishing (Al-Saji, 2002; Verhage, 2008).

⁴ See (Yampolskaja, 2018; Ruĭe, 2011; Ruĭe, 2002; Wiscus, 2015).

⁵ Anna Yampolskaja — DSc in Philosophy, Leading Research Fellow at National Research University "Higher School of Economics" in Moscow.

⁶ Henri Maldiney (1912-2013) — the French phenomenologist, devoted his works to art and madness, and devised a phenomenology of feeling.

⁷ Peter Cheyne — Associate Professor at Shimane University, and Visiting Fellow in Philosophy at Durham University. He leads two international projects, one on the Aesthetics of Perfection and Imperfection, and the other on the 17th- to 19th-century Philosophy of the Life Sciences.

⁸ Andy Hamilton — Professor of philosophy at Durham University, UR. He specialises in aesthetics, philosophy of mind, political philosophy, and history of 19th- and 20th-century philosophy, especially Wittgenstein.

⁹ Max Paddison — Emeritus Professor of Music Aesthetics at the University of Durham. He works in critical theory, philosophy, contemporary music and popular music.

the content of the volume is formed by binding internal rhythm of artworks with human experience. The volume is composed of five sections written by twenty eight researchers around the world from universities of various philosophical traditions: University of Dayton, Durham University, University of Leeds, University of Oxford, Harvard University, University of Sydney, University of London, Trinity College Dublin, University of Liverpool, Lancaster University, Uppsala University, Ohio State University, etc.

The introductory part *Dialogue on Rhythm* shows that philosophical knowledge is always dialogical where not one view prevails. Debate between five *Dramatis Personae* (*Skepticus*, *Dynamicus*, *Metaphysicus*, *Analyticus*, *Vitalia*) is left open: rhythm is characterized exploring different philosophical approaches and viewed as an order within a human body, an intentional phenomenon, a movement-in-time, a movement-in-space, etc. At the beginning of the dialogue the discussion turns to the notion of intentionality:

Musical rhythm is intentional and apparently meaningful. But it seems obvious to me that there are non-intentional meaningless rhythms, such as a train running on a track, a heartbeat, or the drip of a leaky tap. We might call these natural rhythms and distinguish them from human rhythms like music and dance, without denying that making rhythms is natural to us. (Hamilton, 2019, 17)

In any case, rhythm is viewed as a movement of different dispositions and capacities. The conversation between *Dramatis Personae* tries to give clear meanings of used terms—in a Socratic way they maintain a dynamic dialogue trying to find the most apprehensive and precise definitions. They discuss proto-rhythm, movement in music, meaningful order, entrainment, rhythm as the order of movement, human movement, etc., thus accentuating problems going through the following parts and chapters of the book.

The first section of the volume *Movement and Stasis* shows how rhythm is experienced through senses—experience of rhythm is also an experience of movement, and entity on which rhythm is founded form relationships with rhythm itself. The second section *Emotion and Expression* considers a relational perception of rhythm and views the inner constitution of human rhythm and its empathic relations to both—classical as well as popular music. The third section *Entrainment and the Social Dimension* covers such questions as social origin of rhythm and a neuro-psychological approach to rhythm. The latest part of the volume *Reading Rhythm* focuses on literature. Comparing rhythm in different forms of literature it is seen how important the domain of rhythm remains in metrical imagination of the reader even in reading of abstract poetry.

The fourth part *Time and Experience: Subjective and Objective Rhythm* binds rhythm with concepts of experience of time and space, music, graphic arts, body and movement. This part of the volume concerns phenomenology directly; therefore some chapters need a more detailed analysis. In chapter *Time, Rhythm and Subjectivity. The Aesthetics of Duration* Max Paddison analyses how experience of duration transforms in music, dance, literature, how rhythm is considered and how temporality is experienced within pattern of “rhythmicized duration.” Paddison bases on different philosophical interpretations of time: Newton’s conception of absolute and mathematical time without relation to anything external. Bergson’s duration as not measurable flux of experience. Kant’s “insistence that time is not an attribute of the object but is something brought to it by the experiencing subject” (Paddison, 2019, 275). Husserl’s conception of “flow” of time as a continuum uniting lived experience and temporal arts. Paddison turns to Bachelard’s¹⁰ dialectical phenomenology as a particular relevance to the temporal arts as well as to Deliege’s¹¹ philosophy of experience of time as “dependent on the objects and events that occupy our consciousness.” (Paddison, 2019,287). Paddison explores examples from Messianen’s definition of rhythm as “the ordering of movement” that open rhythmical movements also in spatial continuum. In conclusion he binds rhythm with the hermeneutical and historical approach:

I have argued that rhythm needs to be understood not simply as an independent parameter but as a fundamentally structural dimension of the temporal arts. [...] I have also made the claim that our ideas of rhythm, seen in this larger context, are historical and metaphorical in character. (Paddison, 2019, 289)

The chapter, written by Salome Jacob¹², *Husserl’s Model of Time-Consciousness, and the Phenomenology of Rhythm*, examines a model of temporal consciousness of the experience of musical rhythm. She focuses on the question: How is it that one cannot think about rhythm in isolation from the temporal experience of it? In accordance with Husserl’s stances, rhythm is viewed as experienced in living present including flux of three phases: the retention, the primal impression and the protention, thus opening the rhythm of phenomenological time (Husserl, 1991). Exploring Husserl’s well-known example of listening to melody, it is shown as a continuum of perception in listener’s apprehension of temporal relations at each moment. “Husserl’s purpose is

¹⁰ Gaston Bachelard (1884-1962) — French philosopher, the author of *Dialectic of Duration* (2000), *The Poetics of Space* (1957).

¹¹ Célestin Deliege (1922-2010) was a professor of muscology at Le Conservatoire royal de Liege in Belgium.

¹² Salomé Jacob — PhD, Doctor of Philosophy at the University of Durham.

thus two-fold: to account for the experience of temporally extended objects and also to account for the experience of one's ongoing stream of experiences" (Jacob, 2019, 298). In experience of rhythm and melody a double intentionality synchronizes with pre-reflective level of bodily perception and a tacit sense of selfhood. Bodily movements are spatial and temporal:

Admittedly, Husserl's analysis of time cannot do all of the work. [...] Bodily movements follow the expected sonic event and variations in the musical rhythm entail an implicit re-evaluation of the bodily movements. This highlights the particularly rich and complex phenomenology of rhythm, in which temporality interacts with the body. (Jacob, 2019, 305)

Jason Gaiger¹³ in chapter *Pictorial Experience and the Perception of Rhythm* gives a view on how a painting may have a rhythm. He compares rhythmic temporal patterns of sounds with rhythmic spatial patterns of colours: "However, since reference to time is *definitional* for the concept of rhythm as it is employed elsewhere, we risk losing our grip on the meaning of the term if we apply it to spatial phenomena without any temporal reference" (Gaiger, 2019, 311). For argumentation of spatial rhythm in graphic arts Gaiger explores examples of art history—paintings of Wassily Kandinsky, Sonia Delaney¹⁴, Raphael, and connects them with the vision research, that is: a process of viewer's observation of artwork, a determinate sequence of viewing, eye-tracking studies, etc. Gaiger unites the pictorial structure and the perception of it by temporal experience, thus showing an aspect of methodological approach to rhythm studies—based on bilateral relations between work of art and human experience of it.

3. CONCLUSION

Binding theoretical approaches with practices, transformative and fluid processes with concrete patterns of rhythm, it is seen that two interwoven notions are common for all parts and chapters of the volume: rhythm immanence to art, on the one hand, and its temporal and spatial experience, on the other hand. The greatest contribution of the volume is its multidisciplinary approach—it unites philosophers, psychologists, musicians, literary theorists for opening of plural perspectives of rhythm research, and shows that the borders of philosophical studies should be revised and new areas for philosophical reflections about reality should be found.

¹³ Jason Gaiger — Professor of Contemporary Art History and Theory at the Ruskin school of Art.

¹⁴ Sonia Delaunay (1885-1979) — French artist, the first living female artist to have a retrospective exhibition at the Louvre in 1964.

REFERENCES

- Al-Saji, A. (2002). *Rhythms of the Body: A Study of Sensation, Time and Intercorporeity in the Phenomenology of Edmund Husserl*. Emory University, ProQuest Dissertations Publishing. Retrieved from <https://datubazes.lanet.lv:3399/docview/305470809/5556BF8F281A489BPQ/1?accountid=27169>
- Cheyne, P., Hamilton, A., & Paddison, M. (Eds.). (2019). *The Philosophy of Rhythm: Aesthetics, Music, Poetics*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Gaiger, J. (2019). Pictorial Experience and the Perception of Rhythm. In *The Philosophy of Rhythm: Aesthetics, Music, Poetics* (307-331). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Hamilton, A. (Ed.) (2019). Dialogue on Rhythm: Entrainment and the Dynamic Thesis. In *The Philosophy of Rhythm: Aesthetics, Music, Poetics* (15-43). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Husserl, E. (1991). *The Phenomenology of the Consciousness of Internal Time*. Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers.
- Jacob, S. (2019). Husserl's Model of Time Consciousness, and the Phenomenology of Rhythm. In *The Philosophy of Rhythm: Aesthetics, Music, Poetics* (291-307). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Kivle, I. (2020). Choice to Be Happy: Rhythm of Flourishing in Aristotle's, *The Nicomachean Ethics* and Hanna Arendt's, *The Human Condition*. In Boudouris, K. (Ed.), *The Possibility of Eudaimonia (Happiness and Human Flourishing) in The World Today* (139-148). Athens: LAGP.
- Rule, M. (2002). Rhythm and Eternal Recurrence. In *Phenomenology and Culture* (98-107). Riga: University of Latvia.
- KOle, M. (2011). Logos and life: Understanding of Rhythm. In Tymieniecka, A-T. (Ed.), *Ontopoiesis Retrieving Geo-cosmic Horizons of Antiquity* (675-683). London, New York: Springer.
- Paddison, M. (2019). Time, Rhythm, and Subjectivity: The Aesthetics of Duration. In *The Philosophy of Rhythm: Aesthetics, Music, Poetics* (272-291). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Verhage, F. (2008). *The Rhythm of Embodied Encounters: Intersubjectivity in Merleau-Ponty's Phenomenology*. McGill University, ProQuest Dissertations Publishing. Retrieved from <https://datubazes.lanet.lv:3399/docview/304346782/1D31E4174E664427PQ/1?accountid=27169>
- Wiscus, J. (2015). *The Rhythm of Thought: Art, Literature, and Music after Merleau-Ponty*. University of Chicago Press.
- Yampolskaja, A. (2018). The Problematization of the "Aesthetical Experience" in Henri Maldiney's Phenomenology. *Horizon. Studies in Phenomenology*, 7 (2), 414-429. <https://doi.org/10.21638/2226-5260-2018-7-2-414-429>